The Coronanormal Future of Work

John Howard



National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health Centers for Disease Control and Prevention U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

Yuma-Pacific Chapter

American Industrial Hygiene Association

20 January 2022

NOTE:

Presentation does not represent the official position of the

U.S. Department of Health and Human Services or the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention

Overview

Pandemic Challenges

- Global
- Domestic
- Pandemic Futures
 - Strategic Foresight
 - SARS-CoV-2 Trajectory

• Work Futures

- Accelerating Trends
- Coronanormal Futures
 - As You Were
 - Fully Virtual
 - Hybrid



Pandemics: Past and Present

World Pandemics

- In the cholera outbreak of the 1830s, nearly 3% of Parisians died from cholera in a single month.
- At the end of the 19th century, around 1 million people may have died from Russian flu, which experts think was caused by a coronavirus.
- The Spanish flu that struck in 1918 killed around 50 million people in just a couple of years.
- WHO COVID-19 Dashboard
 - <u>https://covid19.who.int</u>



Pandemic: International Challenges

Kahl & Wright (2021); Maçães (2021)

- Pandemic might have been a moment for global co-operation.
- Has not turned out that way so far:
 - Border Closures
 - Vaccine Nationalism
 - Competition Opportunities
 - U.S. and Europe discovered its dependency on exports from China
 - China discovered economic leverage by restricting exports
 - Pandemic treated more as a national security threat than a public health emergency
- World economy is so interconnected that it will not fully recover until every country is able to bring the virus under control.
 - 59.7% of world population has received one dose of a COVID-19 vaccine
 - Only 9.5% of people in low-income countries have received at least one dose of a COVID-19 vaccine
 - <u>https://ourworldindata.org/covid-vaccinations</u>
 - Idea of vaccinating everyone on the planet every six months is not feasible

Pandemic: Domestic Challenges

- In the 2011 movie *Contagion*, fearful nurses walked off the job at the start of the viral pandemic, but once vaccines were available, people enthusiastically lined up and the pandemic was over.
- In the real-life pandemic, the opposite has occurred.
 - From the outset, nurses and other healthcare workers exhibited heroic dedication, as seen in New York City and in cities across the U.S., and they have maintained that dedication throughout the pandemic despite mental and physical stress.
 - While vaccines are now available, millions of Americans have chosen not to get a COVID-19 vaccination.
- Pandemic challenges continue 25 months years after COVID-19 first described in December 2019

Daily Change in COVID-19 Cases, United States

CDO

January 22, 2020* - January 17, 2022

1.400.000

66,715,937 Peaks in Single Day and 7-Day Average of New Cases** 7-Day Average 1.200.000 Single Day **Total Cases Reported** Peak Cases Date Cases Date % Change vs 855,149 Current Avg 1st Peak 34,987 09-Apr-20 31,344 12-Apr-20 2137.4% 1.000.000 2nd Peak 77,073 17-Jul-20 67.679 23-Jul-20 936.2% New Cases Reported** 3rd Peak 294.031 08-Jan-21 250,440 11-Jan-21 180.0% 4th Peak 78.852 09-Apr-21 69.825 13-Apr-21 904.3% 5th Peak 198,847 01-Sep-21 164,233 01-Sep-21 327.0% 701,278 800.000 New Cases 1,344,124 10-Jan-22 796,966 13-Jan-22 -12.0% Latest Current 7-Day Average** Jan 11, 2022 - Jan 17, 2022 600 000 752,343 Prior 7-Day Average** 400.000 Jan 04, 2022 - Jan 10, 2022 -6.8% Change in 7-Day Average 0 Apr 2020 Jul 2020 Oct 2020 Jan 2021 Apr 2021 Jul 2021 Oct 2021 Jan 2022 Submission Date New Cases — 7-Day Average: New Cases**

New Admissions of Patients with Confirmed COVID-19, United States



August 01, 2020 – January 16, 2022



Daily Admissions of Patients with Confirmed COVID-19 — 7-Day Moving Average

Daily Change in COVID-19 Deaths, United States

January 22, 2020* - January 17, 2022





Vaccinated and Non-Vaccinated Americans



2 deaths per 100,000

Domestic: Labor Market Challenges

Source: https://fred.stlouisfed.org/series/PAYEMS

COVID-19 Pandemic

- 22 million jobs lost between Feb/Apr 2020
- 15% drop in total nonfarm employment
- Most severe/abrupt change in total employment over the last 40 years
- Record Job Openings + High Unemployment
 - Job Openings
 - 10.6M
 - Unemployment
 - 8M people considered out of work in the U.S.
 - Quits
 - Quits hit a new series high going back to December 2000, as 4.5M voluntarily left their jobs (3% matching September 2021)
 - BLS, JOLTS, <u>https://www.bls.gov/news.release/jolts.nr0.htm</u> (4 Jan 2022)



Labor mismatches have become prominent across the United States.



US civilian labor-force participation rate,¹%

Job openings have risen beyond pre-COVID-19 levels as the economy bounces back.

However, the labor force is about 4.7 million smaller than it was prepandemic.

Source: Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia March survey; US Bureau of Labor Statistics

Why Slow Return to the Workplace

https://www.cnbc.com/2021/10/20/6-reasons-why-americans-arent-returning-to-work.html

- COVID Transmission Worries
 - Fear of contagion in high-contact industry sectors
- Early retirements
 - Baby boomers are retiring faster than usual
- Added Care responsibilities
 - Women have disproportionately w/d from workforce
 - Reasons
 - School closures depressed female labor participation
 - Caring for COVID-19 affected family member

• More Savings

- Cash balances were up 50% for typical household in July 2021 relative to 2 years ago
- Wages
 - Businesses not paying a wage workers will accept
 - Wages risen more than 4.5%; leisure sector up 11%

Cumulative change in jobs since before the pandemic





- Values
 - Did pandemic make people value work less?

Percentage* of Adults Who Received Any Mental Health Treatment in the Past 12 Months,[†] by Age Group and Year — National Health Interview Survey, United States, 2019–2020[§]

Mental Health Treatment during the Pandemic

CDC QuickStats



MMWR. 2021;70(43):1525.

* 95% confidence intervals indicated with error bars.

[†] Adults were considered to have received any mental health treatment if they reported having taken prescription medication for their mental health or having received counseling or therapy from a mental health professional in the past 12 months.

⁹ Estimates are based on household interviews of a sample of the civilian, noninstitutionalized U.S. population.

The percentage of adults who had received any mental health treatment in the past 12 months increased from 2019 to 2020 overall (19.2% to 20.3%) and among adults aged 18–44 years (18.5% to 20.9%). In 2019, the percentage of adults who had received any mental health treatment in the past 12 months was lower among those aged 18–44 years (18.5%) compared with those aged 45–64 years (20.2%) and 265 years (19.4%). In 2020, the percentage decreased with age, from 20.9% among adults aged 18–44 years to 18.7% among those aged 265 years.

Sources: National Center for Health Statistics. NCHS data brief, no. 380. https://www.cdc.gov/nchs/data/databriefs/db380-H.pdf; NCHS data brief, no. 419. https://www.cdc.gov/nchs/data/databriefs/db419.pdf

Reported by: Emily P. Terlizzi, MPH, ljx9@cdc.gov, 301-458-4991; Tina Norris, PhD.

COVID-19 Has Helped De-Stigmatize Mental Health

https://parade.com/1274973/leighweingus/cleveland-clinic-mental-health-survey-results-2021/

- Survey conducted by *Parade* in partnership with the Cleveland Clinic.
- In polling 2,000 people, results uncovered the importance of mental health.
- In 2018, 68% of people believed mental health was just as important as physical health.
- Now, that number is up to 82%



Strategic Foresight: A Futures Thinking Tool

Strategic Foresight as a Futures Tool

Proactively Managing Change Under Uncertainty

- Strategic foresight is an action-oriented planning discipline grounded in futures studies and strategic management
- Creates plausible future scenarios to identify emerging trends and issues
- Applied in the public and private sectors
- Foresight does not predict the future; it crafts well-informed stories about how the future might be different

Bishop & Hines (2012), Streit et al (2021). The Futures School (2019).



Strategic Foresight

Proactively Managing Change under Uncertainty

- Basic Elements
 - Scan the horizon for trends
 - Identify drivers for trends
 - Create alternative scenarios
 - Monitor scenarios as future unfolds
- Strategic foresight is not about predicting the future, but understanding *probabilities* of multiple alternative futures
- Bias Controls
 - Preferred future may not be the likely future



Foresight Framework

Framing	Scanning	Futuring	Visioning	Designing	Monitoring
the OSH domain	for signals of	plausible future	implications and	strategic	the OSH
	change	scenarios	options	approach	domain
	2	3	4	5	6
Identifying the	Searching for and	Developing	Exploring	Implementing	Monitoring OSH
occupational	organizing signals	baseline and	implications of	strategies to	topic of interest
safety and health	of change in the	alternative future	future scenarios	prepare for	for new signals
topic of interest	domain to identify	scenarios for the	and strategic	plausible futures	of change to
to produce a	emerging issues	domain to	options to	that guide action	continuously
domain	and build a	describe plausible	provide strategic		update the
description	scanning library	futures	direction		domain
Outputs	Outputs	Outputs	Outputs	Outputs	Outputs
Domain Map and	Scanning Library	Drivers	Implications	Key Strategic Issues	Updated
Current	Inputs-	Future Scenarios	Analysis	and Approach	Scanning Library
Assessment	Trends, Issues,				and TIPPS
	Plans,				
	Projections (TIPPS)				

Pandemic Futures

Contagious Disease Futures

Adapted from Dowdle (1996)

• Pandemic

- Active and widespread replication phase
- Deceleration phase

Control

- Cases brought down to a *societally acceptable* level of circulation by vaccines and risk mitigation measures
 - Seasonal Influenza

Elimination

- Cases reduced in a *limited geographical region* to zero
 - Polio and Measles

Eradication

- Cases worldwide reduced to zero
 - Smallpox

• Extinction

- All remaining stocks kept in secure laboratories have been destroyed
 - Smallpox





Home / Newsroom / Events / Detail / EPI-WIN is hosting a series of webinars on the Infectious Hazards foresight initiative



EPI-WIN is hosting a series of webinars on the Infectious Hazards foresight initiative

21 October - 10 December 2021

WHO and partners have embarked in the journey of imagining the future of infectious threats. WHO is hosting a series of consultations convening world leaders and influencers from a variety of disciplines to discuss the future, look at global trends and build consensus on the collective actions that the global community can take to mitigate the ongoing and anticipated risks of COVID-19 and other infectious threats in the next 3 to 5 years.

Related

EPI-WIN: WHO Information Network for Epidemics

Events



Pathogen & Host Characteristics

Key Pandemic Factors

- Public Health & Social Risk Reduction Measures
- Social & Economic Contextual Factors

PATHOGEN AND HOST CHARACTERISTICS				PUBLIC HEALTH AND SOCIAL MEASURES						
Transmissibility	Variant diversity and susceptibility	Human immunity and vulnerability levels	Mortality rate and symptom range	New pandemic risk	Vaccine efficacy and access	Public health measures	Diagnostics, surveillance, and tracking	Treatment and prevention	Healthcare systems response and capacity	Communications patterns
Increased human transmissibility	High variant diversity, high susceptibility to vaccines	High Immunity, Iow vulnerability	High mortality rate, intense symptoms, long duration	New global pandemic emerges, coupled with more dangerous COVID-19	High efficacy, widespread access	Increase in stricter elimination and/or mitigation strategies globally	Robust local, national, and global systems for diagnostics and surveillance	Widespread use of vaccines as the only global treatment and prevention option	High vulnerability of healthcare systems globally, low resilience, backlog of treatment	High volumes of healthcare misinformation and disinformation and high susceptibility of the general public
Increased human transmissibility + sustainable animal viral reservoirs	High variant diversity, low susceptibility to vaccines	Variable immunity, variable vulnerability by region	High mortality, intense symptoms, short duration	New pandemic emerges, coupled with an endemic COVID-19	High efficacy, region- or country specific access	Decrease in stricter elimination strategies, increase in mitigation strategies globally	Robust local and national systems for diagnostics and surveillance, limited global or regional cooperation	Widespread use of vaccines coupled with a variety of treatment and provention options	Low vulnerability of healthcare systems globally, high resilience, effective adaptation to surges in COVID-19	Healthcare misinformation and disinformation restricted to some platforms, groups, and regions only
Variable human transmissibility across variants	Low variant diversity, high susceptibility to vaccines	Variable immunity, variable vulnerability by age group and health status	Mixed mortality rate and variable risk of long symptoms across all age groups	New pandemic emerges after COVID- 19 herd immunity is reached	Mixed efficacy, widespread access	Increase in stricter elimination strategies globally, decrease in mitigation strategies	Variable quality and reach of local and national systems for diagnostics and surveillance	Reduced use of vaccines, high use of treatment and prevention options	Low vulnerability of healthcare systems in certain regions, high vulnerability and low resilience in other regions	Risk, reach and impact of healthcare misinformation and disinformation significantly reduced
Stable human transmissibility	Low variant diversity, low susceptibility to vaccines	Low immunity, high vulnerability	Low overall mortality rate, but risk of long symptoms across all age groups	Future pandemics appear but do not become a global health crisis	Mixed efficacy, region- or country specific access	Widespread decrease in public health measures	Breakdown of local and national systems for diagnostics and surveillance, highly limited provisions	Reduced use of vaccines, limited use of treatment and prevention options		
Reduced human transmissibility		Low immunity, low vulnerability (virus less deadly)	Low mortality rate, low risk of long symptoms		Limited or reduced efficacy					

PATHOGEN AND HOST CHARACTERISTICS				PUBLIC HEALTH AND SOCIAL MEASURES						
Transmissibility	Variant diversity and susceptibility	Human immunity and vulnerability levels	Mortality rate and symptom range	New pandemic risk	Vaccine efficacy and access	Public health measures	Diagnostics, surveillance, and tracking	Treatment and prevention	Healthcare systems response and capacity	Communications patterns
Increased human transmissibility	High variant diversity, high susceptibility to vaccines	High immunity, low vulnerability	High mortality rate, intense symptoms, long duration	New global pandemic emerges, coupled with more dangerous COVID-19	High efficacy, widespread access	Increase in stricter elimination and/or mitigation strategies globally	Robust local, national, and global systems for diagnostics and surveillance	Widespread use of vaccines as the only global treatment and prevention option	High vulnerability of healthcare systems globally, low resilience, backlog of treatment	High volumes of healthcare misinformation and disinformation and high susceptibility of the general public
Increased human transmissibility + sustainable animal viral reservoirs	High variant diversity, low susceptibility to vaccines	Variable immunity, variable vulnerability by region	High mortality, intense symptoms, short duration	New pandemic emerges, coupled with an endemic COVID-19	High efficacy, region- or country specific access	Decrease in stricter elimination strategies, increase in mitigation strategies globally	Robust local and national systems for diagnostics and surveillance, limited global or regional cooperation	Widespread use of vaccines coupled with a variety of treatment and prevention options	Low vulnerability of healthcare systems globally, high resilience, effective adaptation to surges in COVID-19	Healthcare misinformation and disinformation restricted to some platforms, groups, and regions only
Variable human transmissibility across variants	Low variant diversity, high susceptibility to vaccines	Variable immunity, variable vulnerability by ag group and health status	Mixed mortality rate and variable risk of long symptoms across all age groups	New pandemic emerges after COVID- 19 herd immunity is reached	Mixed efficacy, widespread access	Increase in stricter elimination strategies globally, decrease in mitigation strategies	Variable quality and reach of local and national systems for diagnostics and surveillance	Reduced use of voccines, high use of treatment and prevention options	Low vulnerability of healthcare systems in certain regions, high vulnerability and low resilience in other regions	Risk, reach and impact of healthcare misinformation and disinformation significantly reduced
Stable human transmissibility	Low variant diversity, low susceptibility to vaccines	Low immunity, high vulnerability	Low overall mortality rate, but risk of long symptoms across all age groups	Future pandemics appear but do not become a global health crisis	Mixed efficacy, region- or country specific access	Widespread decrease In public health measures	Breakdown of local and national systems for diagnostics and surveillance, highly limited provisions	Reduced use of vaccines, limited use of treatment and prevention options		
Reduced human transmissibility		Low immunity, low vulnerability (virus less deadly)	Low mortality rate, low risk of long symptoms		Limited or reduced efficacy					

Plausible Pandemic Futures

- Like the common cold
- Like seasonal influenza
- Worse than *Delta*
- Therapeutics to the rescue



- Two coronaviruses—SARS-CoV-1 and MERS-CoV—emerged in the recent past but were successfully controlled before they caused a pandemic.
- Four other coronaviruses caused severe disease when they first emerged but are now circulating seasonally around the world causing only very mild symptoms, similar to the common cold.

Coronaviruses	Disease					
SARS-CoV-2	COVID-19					
SARS-CoV	Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS)					
MERS-CoV	Middle East Respiratory Syndrome (MERS)					
HCoV – 229E						
HCoV – OC43	Usually mild respiratory disease (10-15% of common colds caused by HCoVs) but can cause severe disease in vulnerable groups					
HCoV – NL63						
HCoV - HKU1						

Lavine et al. Science (2021)

• Model

- An immunological and epidemiological model asserts that SARS-CoV-2 could become a seasonal virus causing little mortality
- Model shows that such an age-structured system can converge in a matter of years towards a steady state where individuals are infected as children, which allows them to build an immune response with very low mortality.
- This immunity prevents severe symptoms when infected as adults.

• This is a *Rosy* Future

- SARS-CoV-2 may undergo a similar transition like the 4 other common coronaviruses that circulate widely, yet barely trouble health-care systems.
- Modeling does not indicate *when* that transition will happen.

- In the end all pandemics burn themselves out...
 - https://www.economist.com/briefing/2021/10/16/how-the-world-learns-to-live-with-covid-19
- How?
 - Infections reach an equilibrium between susceptibles and the immune
 - Vaccinations and natural infection are the drivers
- Endemic
 - SARS-Cov-2 has a constant presence, but a socially unacceptable number of people
 - *Endemic* is more of a perception
 - Societal tolerance level for severe disease
 - For example, we tolerate a rather high level of mortality from seasonal influenza

Omicron Severity—Toward Endemicity?

- Evidence supports Omicron bring less severe than Delta in vaccinated and boosted
 - But cannot be described as "mild" because of risk of long or chronic COVID
 - Unvaccinated remain at risk of severe acute disease
- Recent CA study examined the outcomes of nearly 70,000 COVID-19 patients and suggests *Omicron* causes less severe disease than previous variants (Lewnard JA et al.)
 - Hospitalization: Omicron 48% less than Delta
 - ICU and death: Omicron 25% less than Delta
 - Aligns with similar data from South Africa, UK and Denmark
- Lab studies show *Omicron's* lower virulence might be due to its tendency to replicate more in upper respiratory tract instead of the lungs
- Some agree that *Omicron* may help push the world further toward COVID-19 endemicity.

- Healthcare System Effects
 - idea that a more transmissible virus results in milder symptoms is "an urban legend."
 - Even if *Omicron* causes milder disease, increased transmission can put additional pressure on health systems. In addition to more patients with mild disease seeking care, milder disease that goes untreated can progress to more severe symptoms, and increased transmission can facilitate further mutations to the virus.

Workplace Effects

- *Endemicity* may not help the unvaccinated
- Leads to a workplace with two subsets of workers with two different risk profiles

Like Seasonal Influenza

Branswell (2021); Joseph (2021)

• Similarity to Influenza

 If SARS-CoV-2 remains quite transmissible, evolves as fast as the influenza virus on a seasonal basis, immunity wanes like influenza, and even breakthrough infections do sometimes result in severe outcomes, you end up with something that looks like an annual influenza season

• Future Scenario

- More cases and more deaths than seasonal influenza (50-100K deaths a year)
- May be more socially acceptable because of COVID-19 fatigue and resentment against the unvaccinated
- May stress healthcare system because COVID-19 will not be "instead," but on "top of" influenza
- "Flurona"
 - COVID-19 occurring at the same time as seasonal influenza in the same individual

Worse than Delta

Alizon & Sofonea (2021)

- A model can be developed that predicts the virus population will evolve towards *avirulence* based on experience with other human coronaviruses, but...
- Important lesson from this pandemic is that extreme care should be taken before comparing SARS-CoV-2 to other viruses, even other human coronaviruses.
- Current trends may <u>not</u> follow the model of a benign coronavirus
 - Emergence of variants like Omicron
 - In unvaccinated populations
 - In immunocompromised individuals where virus continues to replicate
- Immune Escape variant?
 - Mutations leading to escaping vaccine-generated immune protection leads to a protracted pandemic
 - Causing strict mitigation measures (lockdowns; travel interruption; border closures)
 - Reconfiguration of vaccines and reinstitution of population vaccination
 - Pfizer preparing Omicron mRNA vaccine

Worse than Delta

Viral Variant Characteristics

- Transmissibility
- Virulence
- Immune Evasion
- Newest SARS-CoV-2 Variant
 - B.1.1.529 (Greek letter *Omicron* [O]) declared a *Variant of Concern* (26 November 2021)
 - Emerging Omicron Characteristics
 - Transmissibility
 - Significantly more transmissible than Delta
 - Virulence
 - As virulent in the unvaccinated as Delta
 - Immune Evasion
 - Mildly evades vaccine- and natural infection-based immunity



Viral Characteristics Create Our Futures:

• Transmissibility

- Evidence indicates that *Omicron* is more transmissible than the Delta variant. How much more?
- Incorporating uncertainties into scenarios, generates a distribution of outcomes, much like the cone of uncertainty used for a hurricane landfall forecast.

• Immune Evasion

• The future burden of Covid depends in large part on whether highly transmissible variants able to evade pre-existing immunity, such as Omicron, continue to emerge.

Worse than Omicron:

Future is Replication-Dependent

- Interrupting persistent global replication is the key to preventing variant emergence affecting the U.S.
- By the time one variant is detected, another is already emerging under the radar somewhere in the world because of a combination of surveillance lags, low vaccine uptake & inequitable vaccine access to low-income countries.
- If new variants arise roughly twice per year, then we should expect multiple outbreaks each year, even in the summer.
- If such variants emerge less frequently, then outbreaks might occur annually or even less frequently.



Therapeutics to the Rescue

- Monoclonal Antibodies
 - Block SARS-CoV-2 surface proteins and slow it from infecting host cells.
 - Limited supply & expensive (\$2000/dose)
 - Only Sotrovimab appears effective for Omicron
- New Oral Antivirals
 - Molnupiravir (Merck and Ridgeback Biotherapeutics)
 - Reduces the risk of hospitalization by 30%
 - Mode of action is by lethal mutagenesis
 - Paxlovid (Pfizer)
 - Reduces the risk of hospitalization by 89%
 - Drug contains two protease enzyme inhibitors central to SARS-CoV-2 replication—*Nirmatrelvir* and *Ritonavir*
 - Studies show rapid and significant reduction in viral load which could help lower the risk of transmission
 - Must be taken within ≤ 5 days of exposure/onset of symptoms

Two drugs, two targets As SARS-CoV-2 replicates. Pfizer's pill inhibits a viral protease that creates other proteins needed by the virus. Merck's compound introduces disruptive mutations when the virus copies its genome. Attachment and entry lost cell membrane 2 Translation o viral proteins 3 Proteolys PF-07321332 4 RNA replication Replication transcription complex Transcription and 5 translation of structural nd accessory proteins 6 Assembly, packaging and release
Future of Work in the Coronanormal World



Future of Work Pandemic Trends

McKinsey Global Institute (Lund et al. February 2021)

• Trends

- A direction or vector along which drivers of change travel
- Many trends may shape future of work

SARS-CoV-2 Mega-Trend

- Avoidance of physical proximity
- Different Job Types = Different Risk Levels
 - Physical presence not required
 - Physical presence required
 - Physical presence AND physical proximity required



Percentage* of Employed Adults Who Needed to Work Closer Than 6 Feet from Other Persons All or Most of the Time at Their Main Job,[†] by Occupation[§] — National Health Interview Survey, United States, July–December 2020[¶]



3 Trends Accelerated by the Pandemic

Lund et al. February 2021

Shift to Remote Working

• Remote work and virtual meetings are likely to continue, albeit less intensely than at the pandemic's peak, effects for real estate, business travel, and urban centers

Increased Digital Platform Work

• E-commerce and other virtual transactions have greatly accelerated, creating increased demand for non-standard or gig work arrangements for last-mile deliveries

Increased Deployment of Automation and AI

• COVID-19 may propel faster adoption of automation and AI, especially in work areas with high physical proximity, and lead to labor effects

Future of Working Scenarios: 1. Shift to Remote

• As You Were

Virtual

• Hybrid

What is Remote Working?

• Pre-Pandemic—2019 Style

- Prior to the pandemic, work was predominantly *"location-centric,"* designed around the 19th century industrial era constraints of a manual manufacturing era as opposed to the 21st century digital knowledge era.
- Remote working during the pandemic
 - An approach that allows an individual to work in a non-traditional workplace, usually one's home.
 - "Location-independent"
 - Artifact of the pandemic
 - Although "telework" existed prior to the pandemic



Does Working from Home Actually Work?

• Design

Evidence from a Chinese Experiment (Bloom et al. 2015)

- Randomized control trial
 - Two divisions in an [online travel company] headquarters in Shanghai, asked them who wants to work from home four days a week.
 - Evens got work from home and the odds stayed in the office
- Participants
 - 125 in the working from home group and 125 people that were in the control group (coming to the office)
- Observation
 - Performance tracked, minute by minute, for the next 21 months and collected other date on who quit, who got promoted, who did well, who made bonuses
- Findings
 - Employee Productivity
 - Contrary to expectation, the working-from-home employees were 13% more productive than the folks in the office. 4% out of the 13 percent were more productive per minute.
 - Rest of the increase in productivity (9 percent) was due to the fact that folks at home just worked more. Their quit rates were almost half because they were a lot happier. But their promotion rates were almost half of the ones at the office.
 - Firm Advantages
 - For the firm, on average, it was net good because they were more productive, and they saved on office space.

Remote Working

Cambon & Waller (2021)

• Prevalence

• By October of 2020, the proportion of remote workers increased to 71% (Gallup) from 25% pre-pandemic (BLS).

• Employee Attitudes

- 54% liked remote working in a 2021 PEW survey
- 73% in 2021 Microsoft survey hoped that remote work options would be retained post-COVID-19.
- Reasons
 - Fewer commutes to a physical workplace
 - Enhanced childcare opportunities
 - Quieter

Many workers would like to telework after the pandemic is over; transition to working from home has been relatively easy for many

Among employed adults who say that, for the most part, the responsibilities of their job can be done from home, % saying they _____ all or most of the time



Among employed adults who are currently working from home all or most of the time, % saying that, since the coronavirus outbreak, each of the following has been _____ for them



Note: For bottom panel, share of respondents who didn't offer an answer not shown. Source: Survey of U.S. adults conducted Oct. 13-19, 2020.

"How the Coronavirus Outbreak Has - and Hasn't - Changed the Way Americans Work"

PEW RESEARCH CENTER

Remote Working: Downsides for Employee

https://buffer.com/2021-state-of-remote-work

What's your biggest struggle with working remotely?







2021 State of Remote Work

buffer.com/2021-state-of-remote-work

Do I *Work* at Home, or do I *Live* at Work?

Li (2021); Boyd (2002)

- "Context collapse"
 - Originated in the study of the effects of social media.
 - Term coined by Michael Wesch, a cultural anthropologist at Kansas State.
 - Refers to the infinite audience possible online as opposed to the limited groups a person normally interacts with face to face. In a limited group, a person is constantly adjusting their tone and presentation of self to fit into the social context.

• Working Virtually from Home

- Context collapse occurs when individuals face a collision or collapse between boundaries of two or more previously segmented social spaces, for which they previously presented or performed their own *identities* in different manners, often due to the differing norms and natures of the social spaces.
- Shift to remote work, aided by employer monitoring, has eroded the line between office and home

Remote Working: Employer Views

Kobie (2021)

• Business Advantages

- Increased productivity
- Customer satisfaction
- Employee satisfaction
- Real property savings
- Recruitment/retention advantage

• Employer Attitudes

- Pre-Omicron
 - Pretty soon, workplace will return to "normal"
- Corporate America is now coming around to remote work
 - Management-labor power dynamics are changing
- Concerns:
 - Preserving company culture
 - Maintaining performance and collaboration
- <u>https://www.washingtonpost.com/business/2022/01/15/remote-work-omicron/</u>

Working Futures:

Knowledge Workers-Remote is Feasible

Hybrid Approach to Working

Cambon & Waller (2021)

Hybrid Working

- Flexible reporting to the physical workplace as agreed to by employer and employee
- Co-located working versus distributed working—Quadrants 1 to 4

While we may work together when co-located, we often work alone even when seated together.

We don't need to be in the same place to work together.

And working alone where our mindspace is protected from physical and mental distraction — is critical to our productivity and creativity.



Synchronous Work

In hybrid working environments, teams can engineer opportunities to collaborate more intentionally.

Those that do **collaborate intentionally** have a stronger awareness of how, where and when to use each of the four hybrid collaboration modes.

Reasons Why Hybrid Working Will Stick

Barrero JM et al (21 April 2021)

- Survey
 - More than 30,000 Americans over multiple waves to investigate whether WFH will stick, and why.
- Data
 - 20% of full workdays will be remote after the pandemic ends, compared with just 5% before.

Reasons

- Better-than-expected WFH experiences
- New investments in physical and human capital that enable WFH
- Greatly diminished stigma associated with WFH
- Lingering concerns about crowds and contagion risks
- Pandemic-driven surge in technological innovations that support WFH
- Consequences
 - Higher-earnings employees will enjoy large benefits from greater remote work
 - Shift to WFH will directly reduce spending in major city centers by at least 5-10%.
 - Data on employer plans and the relative productivity of WFH imply a 5% productivity boost in the post-pandemic economy due to re-optimized working arrangements.

Working Futures:

Essential Workers— Remote Work Is Not an Option

Physical Presence and/or Proximity Required

Cambon & Waller (2021)



Role	Retail Employee	On-Site Essential Personnel	
Flexibility Options	 Provide employees the choice to schedule and trade their own hours Provide tenured employees options 	 Provide employees transparency into the types of projects available to them 	 Adjust scheduling as needed (i.e., four 10-hour days, not five 8-hour days)
	for what areas they work in and who they work with	 Allow employees to share their workstyle preference 	Provide employees options of which peers they work with on-site
	• Allow employees to work at different locations	 Provide employees choice of when they can start and end each workday 	Authorize remote work when not on-site

Dala

Occupational COVID-19 Transmission: Complex Issue

- Relatively few systematic comparisons of death rates in different occupations using population-level data. Mechanisms driving these differences are not well understood.
- Using a cohort study of over 14 million people aged 40–64 years living in England, researchers analyzed occupational differences in death involving COVID-19, assessed between 24 January 2020 and 28 December 2020.
- Conclusion:
 - Working conditions play a role in COVID-19 mortality, *particularly in occupations involving contact with patients or the public*.
 - However, there is also a substantial contribution from non-workplace factors.
 - Nafilyan V et al. Occup Environ Med Epub ahead of print: [31 December 2021]. https://doi.org/10.1136/oemed-2021-107818

Increased Digital Platform Work

Digital Interactions

- Growth in virtual transactions
 - e-Commerce, telemedicine; online banking; streaming entertainment
 - Physical proximity driver
- Current use → future use
 - 75% of pandemic first-time users say they will continue use
- Trends:
 - Increased growth in delivery, transportation and warehouse jobs
 - Most last-mile delivery jobs are usually nonstandard (gig) work arrangements

E-commerce has grown two to five times faster than before the pandemic.

Year-over-year growth of e-commerce as share of total retail sales, percentage points



Source: Retailing by Euromonitor International, 2021; McKinsey Global Institute analysis

3. Automation & Al

- COVID-19 may accelerate future deployment of robotics in jobs with high scores in human interaction or physical proximity.
- Trends:

Protein processing plants

- Accelerated development in machine vision and robotics to replace more manual operations in protein processing plants
- Self-checkout in retail
 - Grocery stores and pharmacies to meet customer demand for contactless service
- Robotic process automation
 - Loan application processing
 - Handle paperwork surge from government stimulus programs

Employer Monitoring:

Automating Remote Supervision

Ng (2021)

- History
 - Direct Supervision
 - Electronic Performance Monitoring
 - https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/0149206319869435

• Remote Work Monitoring

- An increase in remote working during the pandemic has accelerated employer surveillance of employee productivity
 - Bossware or Tattleware
 - <u>https://www.eff.org/deeplinks/2020/06/inside-invasive-secretive-bossware-tracking-workers</u>
- Computer-work can be easily surveilled through electronic tracking software supplied by many companies

Employer Monitoring:

Automating Remote Supervision

Ng (2021)

- Common Monitoring Features
 - Usage time
 - Keystroke logging
 - Screen shots and screen recordings
 - Web cam/microphone activation
 - Pretty much everything the user does on employer equipment.
- Visible or Invisible?
 - Most companies that offer invisible monitoring recommend that it only be used for devices that the employer owns. However, many also offer features like remote and "silent" installation that can load monitoring software on worker computers, without their knowledge while their devices are outside the office.
 - This works because many employers have administrative privileges on computers they distribute. But for some workers, the company laptop they use is their only computer, so company monitoring is ever-present.

WARNING

Your boss might be spying on you, and it might be dangerous.

Plain Language Report



Bossware: Health & Safety Implications

- Such an increased in employee surveillance may lead to adverse safety and health outcomes for workers, as well as affect employee morale.
- For example, employees can be penalized for engaging in healthenhancing behaviors such as taking rest or bathroom breaks.
- Bossware can be used to enforce a faster work pace and reduce downtime, which increases the risk of physical injuries, particularly those stemming from repetitive motion and can lead to an
 - "increased risk of psychological harm and mental health problems for workers — particularly due to the effects of job strain, which occurs when workers face high job demands but have little control over their work."

<u>https://cdt.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/2021-07-29-Bossware-paper-plain-language-updated-final.pdf</u>

Risk Mitigation Strategies

COVID-19 Hierarchy of Controls

Workplace COVID-19 Plan to Minimize Transmission Risks in a Coronanormal Era



- Prevent viral entry by symptom/temp check
- Vaccination
- SARS-CoV-2 Testing
- Encourage symptom reporting within workplace
- Telework, if feasible
- Medical removal protection & contact tracing



- Restructure workplace spaces to ensure worker distancing
- Use partitions or barriers if workers cannot distance
- Improve ventilation through dilution, filtration, and aircleaning
- Consider upper room germicidal irradiation



- De-densify by reorganizing workflow
- Use staggered shifts
- Infection control practices including barrier face coverings (ASTM F3502-21)
- Perform cleaning and disinfection
- Flexible sick leave
- Train employees in hazards and controls
- Psychosocial support

• Barrier Face Coverings

PPE

- N95s
- Gloves
- Face shields
- Gowns
- Fit-testing and respirator maintenance procedures



Multiple layers improve success.

virologydownunder.com with thanks to jody lanard, katherine arden & the Uni of Qld ad on the Swiss cheese model of accident causation, by James T Reason, 1990 version 3.0 update: 24oct2020

Mandatory and Consensus Risk Mitigation Approaches

- State and Local Requirements
- National Standards
 - OSHA
 - Healthcare Emergency Temporary Standard (withdrawn)
 - General Workplace Emergency Standard (stayed by Supreme Court)
 - Permanent Infectious Disease Standard (in development)
 - CMS/HHS Healthcare Worker Vaccination Interim Final Rule
 - <u>https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2021/11/05/2021-23831/medicare-and-medicaid-programs-omnibus-covid-19-health-care-staff-vaccination</u>
- ISO 45006—Occupational health and safety management preventing and managing infectious diseases General Guidelines for organizations"
 - Guidelines for the prevention of exposure to infectious agents and management of risks to workers and other relevant interested parties from infectious diseases.
 - Excludes organizations that are already implementing mandated infection controls due to the nature of their operations, e.g., hospitals.

In advance of a pandemic, anything you say sounds alarmist.

After a pandemic starts, everything you've done seems inadequate.

Thank You!



Alizon S, Sofonea MT. SARS-CoV-2 virulence evolution: avirulence theory, immunity and trade-offs. J Evol Biol. 2021;001-11. https://doi.org/10.1111/jeb.13896

Baker M. 9 future of work trends post-COVID-19. *Gartner*. April 29, 2021. <u>https://www.gartner.com/smarterwithgartner/9-future-of-work-trends-post-covid-19</u>

Barerro M, Bloom N, Davis SJ. Why working from home will stick. Economics Working Paper 21108. Hoover Institution, Stanford University. April 21, 2021. <u>https://www.hoover.org/sites/default/files/research/docs/21108-davis_barrero_blum_0.pdf</u>

Bishop, P.; Hines, A. Teaching about the Future; Palgrave Macmillan: New York, NY, USA, 2012

Bloom N et al. Does working from home work? Evidence from a Chinese experiment. *Quart J Econ*. 2015;130(1):165-218. <u>https://academic.oup.com/qje/article-abstract/130/1/165/2337855?redirectedFrom=fulltext</u>

Boyd D. Faceted id/entity. Managing representation in a digital world. MIT. 2002. https://smg.media.mit.edu/people/danah/thesis/danahThesis.pdf

Bozio CH et al. Laboratory-confirmed COVID-19 among adults hospitalized with COVID-19-like illness with infection-induced or mRNA vaccine-induced SARS-CoV-2 immunity—Nine States, January—September 2021. *MMWR*. October 29, 2021. <u>https://www.cdc.gov/mmwr/volumes/70/wr/mm7044e1</u>

Branswell H. Winter is coming again: what to expect from COVID-19 as the season looms. September 20, 2021. https://www.statnews.com/2021/09/20/winter-is-coming-again-what-to-expect-from-covid-19-as-the-season-looms/

Bryant-Genevier J et al. Symptoms of Depression, Anxiety, Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder, and Suicidal Ideation Among State, Tribal, Local, and Territorial Public Health Workers During the COVID-19 Pandemic — United States, March–April 2021. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2021;70:947–952. http://dx.doi.org/10.15585/mmwr.mm7026e1

Bureau of Labor Statistics. Job openings and labor turnover. October 12, 2021. https://www.bls.gov/news.release/pdf/jolts.pdf

Cambon A, Waller G. C suite: Redesigning work for a hybrid future. *Garter*. August 2021. <u>https://www.tsae.org/public/upload/files/general/Gartners_Future_of_Work_Ebook.pdf</u>

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). COVID Data Tracker. https://covid.cdc.gov/covid-data-tracker/#datatracker-home

Chari R et al. Expanding the Paradigm of Occupational Safety and Health: A New Framework for Worker Well-Being. J Occup Environ Med. 2018;60(7):589-593. <u>https://doi.org/10.1097/JOM.0000000001330</u>

Cook I. Who is driving the great resignation? *Harv Bus Rev.* September 15, 2021. <u>https://hbr.org/2021/09/who-is-driving-the-great-resignation</u>

COVID-19 Mental Disorders Collaborators. Global prevalence and burden of depressive and anxiety disorders in 204 countries and territories in 2020 due to the COVID-19 pandemic. *The Lancet.* October 8, 2021. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(21)02143-7</u>

Czeisler MÉ et al. Mental health, substance use, and suicidal ideation during the COVID-19 pandemic — United States, June 24–30, 2020. *Morb Mortal Wkly Rep*. 2020;69:1049–1057. <u>https://doi.org/10.15585/mmwr.mm6932a1</u>

Cyphers B, Gullo K. Inside the invasive, secretive "bossware" tracking workers. *Electronic Frontier Foundation*. June 30, 2020. <u>https://www.eff.org/deeplinks/2020/06/inside-invasive-secretive-bossware-tracking-workers</u>

Davis JL, Nathan J. (2014) Context collapse: theorizing context collusions and collisions, Information, Communication & Society. 2014:17(4): 476-485. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/1369118X.2014.888458</u>

DeKock JH et al. A rapid review of the impact of COVID-19 on the mental health of healthcare workers: implications for supporting psychological well-being. BMC Public Health. 2021;21:104-122. <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-020-10070-3</u>

Dowdle W. The principles of disease elimination and eradication. Bulletin WHO. 1996;76(Suppl 2):22-25. www.cdc.gov/mmwr/preview/mmwrhtml/su48a7.htm

Ellingrud K. Future of work post-COVID-19. *Forbes*. March 17, 2021. <u>https://www.forbes.com/sites/kweilinellingrud/2021/03/17/future-of-work-post-covid-19/?sh=480b17df55ef</u>

Facher L. Politics is derailing a crucial debate over the immunity you get from recovering from COVID-19. *STAT*. October 19, 2021. <u>https://www.statnews.com/2021/10/19/politics-is-derailing-a-crucial-debate-over-the-immunity-you-get-from-recovering-from-covid-19/</u>

Feldman JM, Bassett MT. Variation in COVID-19 mortality in the U.S. by race and ethnicity and educational attainment. JAMA Open Network. 2021;4(11):e2135967. <u>https://doi.org/10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2021.35967</u>

Hill L, Marvel M. Mental health in the workplace: tips for supporting workers' mental well-being. *The Synergist*. October, 2021. <u>https://synergist.aiha.org/202110-mental-health</u>

Isidore C. Labor flexes its muscle as leverage tips from employers to workers. CNN Business. October 16, 2021. https://www.cnn.com/2021/10/16/economy/workers-strike-john-deere-iatse-kellogg/index.html

Jha A, Iliff A. How to vaccinate Africa. *Foreign Affairs*. October 26, 2021. <u>https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/africa/2021-10-26/how-vaccinate-africa</u>

Joseph A. Virus expert Trevor Bedford on annual Covid boosters and the inevitable next pandemic. STAT. November 24, 2021. https://www.statnews.com/2021/11/24/virus-expert-trevor-bedford-on-annual-covid-boosters-and-the-inevitable-next-pan

Kahl C, Wright T. Aftershocks. St. Martin Press (2021).

Kobie N. Why bosses are inflexible about flexible work. *WIRED*. November 22, 2021. <u>https://www.wired.com/story/employers-flexible-working-post-pandemic/</u>

Lavine JS, Bjornstad ON, Antia R. Immunological characteristics govern the transition of COVID-19 to endemicity. *Science*. 2021;371:741-745. <u>https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abe6522</u>

Lewnard JA et al. Clinical outcomes among patients infected with Omicron (B.1.1.529) SARS-CoV-2 variant in southern California. https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.01.11.22269045 (posted 11 January 2022)

Li TC. Privacy in pandemic: law, technology, and public health in the COVID-19 crisis. Loyola University Chicago Law J. 2021. 52:767-865

Lund S, Madgavkar A, Manyika J et al. The postpandemic economy: future of work after COVID-19. February 2021. *McKinsey Global Institute*.

https://www.mckinsey.com/~/media/mckinsey/featured%20insights/future%20of%20organizations/the%20future%20of%20work%20aft er%20covid%2019/the-future-of-work-after-covid-19-report-vf.pdf?shouldIndex=false

Maçães B. Geopolitics for the End Time. Hurst. 2021.

Madrigal AC. The messiest phase of the pandemic yet. *The Atlantic*. August 15, 2021. <u>https://www.theatlantic.com/health/archive/2021/08/why-pandemic-so-bad-florida/619761/</u>

Malone TW. *The future of work. How the new order of business will shape your organization, your management style, and your life.* Boston, MA: Harvard Business School Press (2004).

Malone TW. Superminds. The surprising power of people and computers thinking together. New York, NY: Little, Brown and Co. (2018)

Monto AS. The future of SARS-CoV-2 vaccination—lessons from influenza. New Engl J Med. 2021;385(20):1825-1827.

Newport C. Revisiting the 4-hour workweek. *New Yorker*. October 25, 2021. <u>https://www.newyorker.com/culture/office-space/revisiting-the-4-hour-workweek?utm_source=newsletter&utm_medium=email&utm_campaign=newsletter_axiosfuture</u>

Ng MA et al. Has the COVID-19 pandemic accelerated the future of work or changed its course? Implications for research and practice. *Int J Environ Res Public* Health. 2021;18:10199-10227. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph181910199</u>

Orel B, Bloom N. The future of remote work: highlights from my conversation with Nicholas Bloom. AEI. October 14, 2021. https://www.aei.org/uncategorized/the-future-of-remote-work-highlights-from-my-conversation-with-nicholas-bloom/

Parker K, Horowitz JM, Minkin R. How the coronavirus outbreak has—and hasn't—changed the way Americans work. *Pew Research Center*. December 9, 2020. <u>https://www.pewresearch.org/social-trends/2020/12/09/how-the-coronavirus-outbreak-has-and-hasnt-changed-the-way-americans-work/</u>

Pollard MS et al. Changes in adult alcohol use and consequences during the COVID-19 pandemic in the US. *JAMA Netw Open*. 2020;3(9):e2022942. <u>https://doi.org/10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2020.22942</u>

Ravid DM et al. EPM 20/20: a review, framework, and research agenda for electronic performance monitoring. *J Manage*. 2020;46(1):100-126. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/0149206319869435</u>

Renna F, Coate P. Is there a labor shortage? Quarterly Economics Briefing Q2—2021. *National Council on Compensation Insurance (NCCI)*. August 11, 2021.

https://www.ncci.com/SecureDocuments/QEB/Insights-2021-Q2_LaborShortage_2021.html

Scherer M. Warning: bossware may be hazardous to your health. *Center for Democracy and Technology*. July 24, 2021. <u>https://cdt.org/insights/report-warning-bossware-may-be-hazardous-to-your-health/</u>

Scudellari M. How the coronavirus infects our cells. Nature. 2021;595:640-644. <u>https://media.nature.com/original/magazine-assets/d41586-021-02039-y/d41586-021-02039-y.pdf</u>

Schwartz P. The pandemic era has begun: how to navigate challenges and opportunities in an uncertain future. Salesforce. September 16, 2021. <u>https://www.salesforce.com/news/stories/the-pandemic-era-has-begun-how-to-navigate-challenges-and-opportunities-in-an-uncertain-future</u>

Shamier MC et al. Virological characteristics of SARS-CoV-2 vaccine breakthrough infections in health care workers. *medRxiv.* August 21, 2021. <u>https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2021.08.20.21262158v1</u>

Song J et al. Online mingling: supporting ad hoc, private conversations at virtual conferences. *SSRN.* August 4, 2020. <u>https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3662620</u>

Streit, JMK et al. Leveraging Strategic Foresight to Advance Worker Safety, Health, and Well-Being. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health.* 2021;18:8477. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph18168477</u>

Su S, Wong G, Shi W et al. Epidemiology, genetic recombination, and pathogenesis of coronaviruses. *Trends Microbiol*. 2016;24(6);490-502. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tim.2016.03.003</u>

Taylor S. *The psychology of pandemics*. Newcastle upon Tyne, UK: Cambridge Scholars Publishing (2020).

Warzel C, Petersen AH. Out of office. New York, NY: Knopf. 2021

Western R. Building better work models for the next normal. MIT Sloan Management Review. April 21, 2021. <u>https://sloanreview.mit.edu/article/building-better-work-models-for-the-next-normal/</u>
References

Whillians A, Lockhart C. A guide to implementing the 4-day work week. *Harvard Business Review*. September 28, 2021. <u>https://hbr.org/2021/09/a-guide-to-implementing-the-4-day-workweek?ab=seriesnav-bigidea</u>

Work Trend Index: Annual Report. March 22, 2021. *Microsoft*. <u>https://ms-</u> worklab.azureedge.net/files/reports/hybridWork/pdf/2021_Microsoft_WTI_Report_March.pdf

Worobey M. Dissecting the early COVID-19 cases in Wuhan. Science, 2021;34(6572):1202-1202. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abm4454

Zhang S. America has lost the plot on COVID. The Atlantic. November 1, 2021. https://www,theatlantic.com/health/archive/2021/11/what-Americas-covid-goal-now/6205721/

Zeitchik S. MIT expert on work says and boss who thinks employees will return to offices is dreaming. *Washington Post.* October 26, 2021. <u>https://www.boston.com/news/business/2021/10/26/mit-expert-on-work-says-any-boss-who-thinks-employees-will-return-to-offices-is-dreaming/?p1=hp_featurestack</u>